



Ministry for Primary Industries  
Manatū Ahu Matua



**To:** Hon Todd McClay, Minister of Agriculture  
Hon Simon Watts, Minister of Climate Change  
**From:** Julie Collins, Deputy Director-General Policy and Trade,  
Ministry for Primary Industries  
Sam Buckle, Deputy Secretary Climate Change Mitigation and Resource  
Efficiency, Ministry for the Environment

## Shortlisting of candidates for the Methane Science and Target Review Panel

<b>Date</b>	22 May 2024	<b>Reference</b>	MPI: B24-0359 MfE: BRF-4767
-------------	-------------	------------------	--------------------------------

<b>Decision required</b>	<b>Date decision required by</b>
YES <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> / NO <input type="checkbox"/>	27 May 2024

### Purpose

- This briefing seeks your agreement to a proposed Panel membership for the Methane Science and Target Review (the Panel).

### Context

- On 2 April, you informed Cabinet that an independent Panel would be established to review New Zealand's 2050 biogenic methane science and target for consistency with no additional warming (the Review) [CAB-24-MIN-0109].
- The draft Cabinet paper 'Initiating the Methane Science and Target Review' (due for lodgement with Cabinet Economic Committee (ECO) on 23 May) notes that a Panel of three to five scientific experts, and an independent chair, will carry out the review between July and November 2024.
- Once you have considered and directed officials on the Panel membership, we will draft a paper including this list for consideration at the Cabinet Appointment and Honours Committee (APH) on 18 June. To enable the review to be initiated by 30 June, this paper would then be considered by Cabinet on 24 June 2024.

## Candidate selection process

### *Step One: Selection of longlist of Panel candidates*

4. To support a robust and independent process, officials from MfE and MPI nominated 42 individuals from New Zealand and overseas that had a range of the following expertise and knowledge:
  - a) climate science – including climate modelling and the warming impact of short and long-lived greenhouse gases;
  - b) New Zealand’s greenhouse gas emissions, particularly biogenic methane; and
  - c) understanding of New Zealand’s climate change targets and budgets under the Climate Change Response Act 2002.
5. The longlist of candidates was reviewed to determine whether they were reputable in their field and brought a range of views on the role of methane emissions in the global context and in meeting New Zealand’s biogenic methane targets.
6. The following selection criteria assessment was applied to the longlist:
  - a) knowledge – qualification, technical/policy knowledge, and sector knowledge/context;
  - b) skills/capabilities – credibility and experience within the agriculture sector, strategic/cultural/mātauranga Māori perspective; and
  - c) expertise – networks and affiliations, and contribution to science panels and/or papers.
7. A panel from MfE and MPI evaluated the longlist of candidates against the selection criteria and required expertise and determined a shortlist of two potential chairs and ten Panel members. On 11 April, you provided feedback on this list [MfE BRF-4562 and MPI B24-0276 refers] and engaged with coalition partners resulting in a total of 13 potential candidates (after removing duplicate cross-party nominations) approved for officials to contact.
8. During May, these 13 candidates were screened for availability and interest in participating in the Panel. 12 candidates have provided expressions of interest together with a curriculum vitae and conflict of interest declaration (see **Appendix Two**).

### *Step Two: Assessment of candidates to determine an appropriate shortlist*

9. To support the selection of a shortlist of candidates, a skills matrix was designed to assess the capabilities each candidate would bring to the Panel. The matrix assessed governance and panel/board experience, and regulatory/central government experience, together with each candidate’s specific area of expertise, knowledge of climate science, and climate modelling capabilities.
10. To determine an effective Panel composition, additional consideration was given to balancing different scientific perspective and expertise, gender, and the make-up of panel size to enhance reputability and the outcome of the Review.


11. Declared conflicts of interest did not restrict selection of any candidates at this stage in the selection process. Once the desired final panel has been determined, a full background check will be undertaken for each panellist prior to APH confirmation.

**Proposed Panel membership**

12. Officials assessed the 12 interested candidates for the Panel against the skills matrix and selection criteria, and because of this, recommend five Panel members and a chair for your consideration (proposed in Table One). We have determined that the proposed Panel members provide an effective panel composition, that balances necessary experience, skills, and perspectives to respond to the Review’s Terms of Reference.
13. Having five members plus a chair provides for some resilience if any member is unable to fulfil their obligations during the term of the Panel. This alleviates the timeframe risk of having to follow the APH appointment process to fill a departing Panel members’ position (as replacement might not be necessary).
14. The proposed term below includes the time carrying out the Review, plus a potential one-month contingency period.
15. Further background information on each of the proposed members is provided in **Appendix One**. We recommend all are put forward to the APH committee for consideration.

*Table One. Proposed Panel membership for the Methane Science and Target Review*

9(2)(g)(i)



18. If you prefer to substitute any of the proposed Panel members from Table One with any of those in the shortlist in **Appendix Two** officials can provide additional advice on alternative composition of panel members to support the review when they meet with you on 30 May 2024.

19. It is important to note that there is a risk officials may not be able to confirm or appoint all panellists proposed, particularly due to the Cabinet Fees Framework remuneration range. Should this occur, officials will present alternative panellists for your consideration.

#### *Cabinet Fees Framework Classification*

20. Under the Cabinet Fees Framework (the Framework), the Panel is classified<sup>1</sup> as Group 4 Level 1<sup>2</sup> with specified daily fee level range of \$446 to \$952 for Panel members and \$594 to \$1,265 for a chair.

#### **Next Steps**

21. A joint meeting between yourselves and officials is scheduled for 30 May to discuss the proposed Panel membership and agree on the final list to take to APH. The potential contingency period should also be discussed in this meeting if the proposed term needs beyond extended to the 31 December 2024.
22. Officials are drafting a paper for APH consideration on 18 June and Cabinet on 24 June that signals your intention to appoint the 'Methane Science and Target Review' Panel. We intend to provide this paper to you on 31 May, following your direction on Panel membership.
23. Once you have confirmed your preferred list of Panel members, officials will finalise candidates' interest, background, and conflicts of interest checks. We will seek confirmation of interest in principle subject to confirmation of fee rates. This will be complete prior to Ministerial consultation on the APH paper in early June.

---

<sup>1</sup> The Framework classifies member appointed bodies in which the Crown has an interest into one of four groups. Cabinet has agreed to a schedule of fees for all categories that is factored based on skills knowledge and experience; function, level, and scope of authority; public interest and profile; and complexity of issues.

<sup>2</sup> Group 4: All other Committees and Other Bodies; Level 1 (highest fee rates)

## Recommendations

24. It is recommended that you:

- a) **Note** that Ministers are required to provide nominations for the Methane Science and Targets Review Panel that demonstrate Ministers' intent at the Cabinet Appointments and Honours Committee on 18 June, for confirmation by Cabinet on the 24 June 2024.

**NOTED**

- b) **Agree** to the proposed Panel membership, which officials consider collectively has the mix of skills and experience necessary to respond to the Review's Terms of Reference effectively and reputably, to take for consideration by the Cabinet Appointments and Honours Committee on 18 June and Cabinet on 24 June 2024.

- i. 9(2)(g)(i)
- ii.
- iii.
- iv.
- v.
- vi.

- c) **Note** that should you wish to proceed with alternative candidates to those proposed, we can provide you with additional advice to ensure that Panel composition remains consistent with the Review's Terms of Reference. Officials will meet with you to discuss the Panel on 30 May, during which the panel membership can be finalised.

**NOTED**

- d) **Indicate** whether you wish to proceed with any other candidate(s) from the agency-complied shortlist of potential panellists by noting their name(s) below:

9(2)(a)



Julie Collins  
Deputy Director-General  
Policy and Trade  
Ministry for Primary Industries

Hon Todd McClay  
Minister of Agriculture

/ / 2024



Sam Buckle  
Deputy Secretary  
Climate Change Mitigation and Resource  
Efficiency  
Ministry for the Environment


Hon Simon Watts  
Minister of Climate Change

/ / 2024

**Appendix One: Proposed panel membership for the Methane Science and Target Panel Review**

---

9(2)(g)(i)



**Appendix Two: Agency-compiled shortlist of potential panellists**

---

9(2)(g)(i)

